

UNIVERSITY OF DUNDEE**UNIVERSITY COURT**

A meeting of the University Court was held on 12 June 2006.

Present: Mr J R Milligan (in the Chair), Principal Sir Alan Langlands, Dr R J Abboud, Ms C A Bain, Professor A Burchell, Dr J R Elliott, Mr B W M Johnston, Dr J Lowe, Dr H Marriage, Ms E A Robertson, Dr L A L Rolland, Mr E F Sanderson, Mr W Sutherland and Mr W Wilson.

In Attendance: Vice-Principals Professor D H Boxer and Professor J Calderhead, Dean of Nursing & Midwifery, Secretary, Deputy Secretary & Clerk to Court, Directors of Finance, Human Resources, Information Services, Research & Innovation Services and Strategic Planning, President-Elect of the Students' Association, President and President-Elect of the Sports Union.

The Chairman welcomed the student officers present, particularly Steven Blane who, as President-Elect of the Students' Association, was representing the President at this meeting and would become a full Court member from 1 August 2006.

64. SPORTS UNION

The Court received an annual report for the Sports Union for 2005-06, which was presented by its President, James Rea. As well as sporting successes, the President referred to valuable partnerships from which the Sports Union had benefited: with the Institute of Sport & Exercise, the Students' Association and Dundee City Sports Council.

In discussion it was noted that some 10% of the student population were currently involved in sporting activity, although the numbers were rising: efforts were being made by the Sports Union to increase participation through initiatives such as internal sporting leagues, separate from elite and club level competition. One Court member queried, with reference to the acquisition by the Sports Union of replacement minibuses, whether vehicle purchase was still the most cost-effective means of providing transport for sports clubs. On another point, the President confirmed that sports facilities were an important consideration in the evaluation of universities by potential students and the Court was reminded of current and planned investment in this University's facilities.

The Court decided: to thank the President for his comprehensive and informative report and to congratulate sports clubs and individual students on their achievements.

65. **MINUTES**

The Court decided: to approve the Minutes of the meeting on 24 April 2006.

66. **MATTERS ARISING**

Restructuring of the University – Charter, Statutes and Ordinances (Minute 56)

The Deputy Secretary & Clerk to Court reported that the Privy Council had approved, in Orders dated 7 June 2006, the proposed amendments to the University Charter and Statutes, thus enabling the restructuring of the University into four Colleges to proceed. The proposed amendments to the University Ordinances, approved for the first time at the Court's previous meeting, had now received the Senate's consent.

The Court decided: to ratify the following amendments to the University Ordinances, to take effect from 1 August 2006:

- (a) revocation of Ordinance 19 – Constitution of Faculty Boards and Ordinances 44, 47, 48, 51, 52 and 53 (concerning the titles of Faculties);
- (b) amendment of Ordinances 18, 39, 40 and 54 and the making of new Ordinances 56 and 57 (**Appendix 1**).

67. **CHAIRMAN'S BUSINESS**

The Chairman referred to the recent ceremony to install the new Chancellor, which had been a very significant and enjoyable event. He reminded members that the Chancellor was by Statute a full member of the Court and was entitled to attend Court meetings in addition to the Chancellor's Assessor. The latter role would continue to be performed by Dr Larry Rolland.

68. **PRINCIPAL'S REPORT**

The Court received a report from the Principal (**Appendix 2**). In presenting the report, the Principal drew attention to the following:

- (a) A national settlement had been reached which had ended the industrial dispute affecting student assessments (see also Minute 69 below). It was expected that all final year students would be fully assessed in sufficient time to enable them to graduate normally.
- (b) There was a strong field of candidates for all four Head of College posts, for which interviews would be held later in the week. The

posts of Deans of Schools had also now been advertised and it was hoped that most of these would be filled during July. In answer to questions, the Principal commented on the appointing process.

- (c) The period ahead from 2006-07 would see the University facing the toughest financial challenges it had encountered for some time. This would be discussed in greater detail in consideration of the financial strategy (see Minute 70(2) below). The main objective for the University in meeting these challenges was to maintain quality of provision in both staffing and facilities. The situation in which the University found itself was replicated across Scotland: ultimately a solution would have to be found by the Scottish Executive, either through increasing student contributions (i.e. introducing top-up fees, as in England, or something similar) or possibly through a radical restructuring of the sector.

The Principal also referred to the opening of Tayside Children's Hospital on 7 June 2006, an initiative which had been strongly supported by both the University and NHS Tayside and which had been the subject of a public fundraising campaign. Unlike other children's hospitals in Scotland, the new facility at Ninewells was an integral part of the larger teaching hospital and was unusual in having research activity co-located with clinical services.

69. INDUSTRIAL ACTION

The Director of Human Resources reported on the agreement which had been reached between UCEA and the recognised trade unions. The settlement involved staged increases over three years, although the total cost was not clear as the final component payable from October 2008 would be replaced by an RPI increase if the latter were greater. The settlement also provided for a review of institutional finances and pay levels in the sector and a review of the process for national pay negotiations. Pending a ballot of its members on the terms of the pay deal, UCU (the successor union to AUT) had agreed to suspend immediately all industrial action.

70. FINANCIAL PLANNING

(1) Finance & Policy Committee

The Court received the report of a meeting of the Committee on 22 May 2006 (**Appendix 3**). The Court's attention was drawn to the Committee's recommendations on pensions (item 5). A recommendation on increased contributions to the University of Dundee Superannuation Scheme was the subject of a separate paper (see Minute 70(4) below). The Committee had also recommended that employer contributions to the Universities Superannuation Scheme should not be paid beyond the current maximum of 40 years of service and this position had been supported by the Human Resources Committee. It was noted that the Trustees of the University

of Dundee Superannuation Scheme had come to a similar view, in relation to that scheme, on the issue of maximum contributions.

- The Court decided:**
- (i) to approve the recommendation that employer contributions to USS should not be paid beyond the current maximum of 40 years;
 - (ii) otherwise, to approve the report.

(2) Financial Strategy

The Court received an updated financial strategy for the five-year period to July 2011. The document was presented by the Director of Finance, who reminded the Court of the aims of the strategy. Detailed budgets had been developed for 2006-07, which formed the baseline for future years. Clear budgetary limits had been set for Colleges and Schools in the new academic management structure. The capital programme had been reviewed to ensure that the University remained within the agreed cap on borrowing, while the generation of cash to support the capital programme and repay borrowings was a key objective of the strategy. Even so, it was recognised that the borrowing limit might need to be exceeded for short periods to maintain cash flow. It would be a difficult task to achieve the budgeted surplus of £5m in 2006-07 and projected surpluses for succeeding years, rising to £13.5m by 2008-09. To attain such levels of surplus would require significant increases in income and cost reductions from 2007-08. The sensitivity analysis in the strategy showed that the financial projections were more sensitive to cost increases than to shortfalls in income.

In discussion it was accepted that core staffing costs would have to be reduced to make the strategy work. Precipitate action was not required, however, as economies had already been made in the budget proposals for 2006-07. Dundee and the other research-intensive universities in Scotland were in a slightly better position than the predominantly teaching institutions because of increased funding for research in the SFC grant settlement. It was stressed that the financial difficulties which the sector was facing were not a result solely of the national agreement on pay: other cost pressures and wider structural issues also played their part.

Other points raised in discussion included the following:

- (a) The impact of full economic costing would ensure increased overhead recovery on individual projects, but was also likely to mean an overall reduction in the number of grants awarded. The University was vulnerable because of the high proportion of research income from medical charities, where there would be no FEC benefit; on the other hand, the translational medicine research initiative would help to generate an increase in FEC-funded projects.

- (b) While incentives had been devised to encourage enterprise and the development of surplus-generating activity by Colleges and Schools, there was a recognised tension between their use of accrued reserves and the institutional priority to retain cash.
- (c) It was argued that the University should make greater efforts to be more cost-effective in areas such as energy consumption and procurement, collaborating not only with other educational institutions but with public services. Reference was made to the McClelland report on public procurement, which was under consideration within the sector - but it was thought unlikely that any consequential changes in approach would have immediate impact.
- (d) It was suggested that the principle of full economic costing should also be applied to teaching and it was confirmed that SFC was likely to return to the issue of the funding methodology for teaching. It was pointed out, however, that there were other pressures affecting the tertiary education system as a whole.
- (e) While there were significant risks around the capital programme, projects within it amounting to c. £58m had not yet been approved by the Court. This provided sufficient flexibility to control capital spending. It was acknowledged that it was difficult to strike a balance between staff costs and infrastructure costs, but investment in the estate was still regarded as a high priority to ensure that the University remained competitive in student and staff recruitment.

- The Court decided:**
- (i) to approve the proposed budgets for Colleges, Schools and support services for 2006/07;
 - (ii) to approve the amended capital programme, and to allow that the period of maximum borrowing (i.e. when the agreed borrowing limit of £15m could be temporarily raised to £20m) should be increased from two years to three years;
 - (iii) to invite the Finance & Policy Committee to meet during the summer to test in detail the key parameters for financial planning and the assumptions underlying the financial strategy;
 - (iv) to invite the Senior Management Team to produce plans for the Court Retreat in September for addressing the medium

and longer term questions of financial sustainability – such proposals to be accompanied by a clear timetable for action in the period from September to January 2007.

(3) Strategic Plan Forecasts

The Court received detailed financial forecasts for the period to 2008-09, which were required by SFC. The forecasts were accompanied by an explanatory note from the Director of Finance. It was noted that the forecasts projected a deficit for 2006-07 which would be converted into a surplus in the financial strategy only by the sale of properties. This clearly emphasised the need for urgent measures, as envisaged in the financial strategy, to restore the position of operating surpluses.

The Court decided: to approve the strategic plan forecasts for submission to SFC.

(4) University Superannuation Scheme

The Court received a paper by the Director of Finance, on behalf of the Finance & Policy Committee, inviting the Court to approve revised levels of contribution by both employees and employer following a triennial actuarial valuation of the University of Dundee Superannuation Scheme and consideration of its implications by the Trustees of the Scheme. The proposed increase for employees would be from 6% to 7.75%, and for the employer 13.5% to 20.55% - an additional annual cost to the University of up to £900k. The increases had been calculated to fund the deficit in the Scheme over a period of 13 years (representing the average length of time until the current members reached retirement age). It was confirmed in discussion that the Trustees included current employees, who had taken soundings from members regarding a level of increase that would be considered acceptable - and who had reported back that there was strong membership support for the Scheme; also, that the Trustees had taken note of changes occurring in similar pension schemes elsewhere.

The Court decided: (i) to approve the recommended levels of increase in contributions for both employees and employer;

(ii) to authorise the Director of Finance, in consultation with the Convener of the Finance & Policy Committee, to seek the most cash-efficient means of funding the additional employer's contributions, including borrowing (over and above the maxima already approved by Court in relation to the capital programme).

(5) Banking Matters

- The Court decided:**
- (i) to approve the following arrangements attaching to the University's account with the Royal Bank of Scotland:
 - (a) an increase in the Group overdraft limit from £100k to £1m as the University approached a period of maximum borrowing and significant capital payments;
 - (b) application on the Court's behalf by the Director of Finance for the provision of electronic banking services via the Internet;
 - (ii) to authorise the Chairman to sign the relevant documents.

71. **INSTITUTIONAL PERFORMANCE INDICATORS**

The Court received a biannual report on key institutional performance indicators, integrated with updates on progress in achieving the objectives set out in the *Towards 2007* planning document. Officers addressed comments and questions from members on various issues arising from the data. It was agreed that the meagre evidence provided in the report to demonstrate successful implementation of the University's staff development policy belied the actual level of activity in this area, which was the subject of report to each meeting of the Human Resources Committee; the Director of Human Resources indicated also that further initiatives in staff development would be undertaken once resources could be released from implementation of the Framework Agreement.

- The Court decided:**
- (i) to express concern that in two consecutive reports on performance indicators no information had been submitted by the Faculty of Duncan of Jordanstone College;
 - (ii) otherwise, to note the report.

72. **PLANNING FRAMEWORK 2006-12**

The Court received a document setting out a planning framework for the period 2006-12, identifying key 'thinking themes' and action strands. While establishing a context for the years ahead, the document acknowledged that at a time of organisational change it was premature to be overly prescriptive about the vision for the next planning cycle. The following points arose in discussion, in relation to specific objectives set out in the plan:

- (a) The continuous review and development of academic programmes, in support of providing the best student experience, was linked in the document with a target of improving the undergraduate retention rate: it was pointed out, however, that the latter was not linked solely to the quality of teaching.
- (b) The objectives set out for increasing postgraduate activity had clear resource implications and, as elsewhere in the document, further thought should be given to differentiating between immediate and longer term priorities.
- (c) In the context of the declared objective for Human Resources of embedding and supporting a culture of performance improvement, there was general agreement that the voluntary nature of the University's personal review scheme for academic and related staff was no longer sustainable. This had also been commented on by the Audit Committee.

The Court decided: to welcome and approve the planning framework, while recognising that it was a work in progress and would be further developed as the new organisational regime unfolded.

73. NURSING EDUCATION IN FIFE

The Court received a report from the Secretary summarising the position reached on the future of the University's Kirkcaldy campus (which had been the subject of a full discussion at the Court's meeting on 20 February 2006). As the result of contractual and accreditation constraints imposed by the Chief Nursing Officer, NHS Education for Scotland and the Nursing & Midwifery Council, the University could not achieve its original aim of centralising all theoretical teaching in Dundee as previously discussed with NHS Fife. It was therefore proposed that the theoretical components of the first two years of the nursing programme should continue to be offered in both Dundee and Kirkcaldy, while from September 2009 the (much smaller) theoretical component of the third year would be delivered in Dundee only. At the same time, it was proposed to continue discussions with Adam Smith College with the aim - subject to agreement on financial and management arrangements and further consultation with stakeholders - of creating an enhanced learning environment for nursing students in Fife. The Dean of Nursing & Midwifery provided further comment on the key issues.

Court members had also received individually a document advocating retention of the Kirkcaldy campus, which had been drawn up by Fife-based staff of the School of Nursing & Midwifery with cross-party support from local MSPs. It was pointed out that the proposals in the document required significant investment in a building which the University did not own. By its own admission, the paper did not take account of the overall financial position of the School or of the University and this was not a sensible basis for discussion. Notwithstanding the decision to continue with theoretical

instruction in Fife, the costs of operating the Fife campus were a serious issue which remained to be addressed.

- The Court decided:**
- (i) to accept the position as set out in the Secretary's report, together with the proposed further involvement of Adam Smith College, as an interim solution to the issues surrounding nursing education in Fife;
 - (ii) to endorse the proposal that the Principal and other senior officers should meet with Fife-based staff in the School of Nursing & Midwifery to discuss the way forward.

74. TECHNOLOGY VENTURE FUND

The Director of Research & Innovation Services presented a paper which recommended the establishment of a Technology Venture Fund, building on the existing commercialisation infrastructure in which the University had already invested. It was proposed that the University entered into partnership with an identified fund manager and that the partners would each commit £500k over a period of five years. The fund manager would undertake to increase the fund to a value of £8-10m by securing contributions from institutional investors. The fund would have an anticipated 10-year lifespan starting in January 2007 and would invest exclusively in spin-out companies emerging from the University.

The projected benefits to the University from the proposed fund would be enhanced potential for financial return from spin-out activity by mitigating dilution of equity, together with increased efficiency in company creation through more ready access to finance. It was clarified in discussion that, as far as was known, there were no comparable schemes in other institutions. A note of caution was sounded about the difficulty of attracting finance for this sort of activity and the importance of securing the full commitment of investors. Reference was also made to the Intermediary Technology Institutes (one of which was located in Dundee) - but it was noted that these operated in a different way, providing support to businesses rather than to universities.

The Court decided: to approve the establishment of a University of Dundee Technology Venture Fund on the basis proposed.

75. MEMBERSHIP OF COURT

The Court was reminded that Mr Bill Sutherland would be completing his second term of office on Court as a co-opted member on 31 July 2006 and that the Court had already approved the appointment of his successor, Mr Richard Burns (Minute 69, meeting of 13 June 2005). The term of office of Ms Alison Newton as a co-opted member was also due to expire on 31 July 2006, but she was eligible for re-appointment.

The Court decided: to reappoint Ms Newton for a second term of office to 31 July 2010.

76. COURT COMMITTEES

(1) Committee Membership 2006-07

- The Court decided:**
- (i) to invite Mr Richard Burns to assume convenership of the Audit Committee, in succession to Mr Sutherland;
 - (ii) otherwise, to delegate authority to the Chairman to review the Committee membership list with the Clerk to Court and report back to the next meeting – while noting that a further review might be necessary in the early part of the new session following elections to the restructured Senate (which might have implications for Court membership).

(2) Emergency Committee

The Court decided: to remit the transaction of any urgent Court business over the summer to an Emergency Committee, comprising the Principal or a Vice-Principal (Convener), two lay members (normally the Chairman of Court and the Convener of the Finance & Policy Committee) and one other academic member – subject to a report on any action taken being submitted to the first business meeting of the Court in 2006-07.

77. STUDENTS' ASSOCIATION

The Court received (a) proposed amendments to the DUSA Constitution approved by a General Meeting on 15 May 2006, (b) a list of proposed non-student appointments to the DUSA Board of Management, and (c) a report on a student welfare survey, carried out under the auspices of a joint working group of University and DUSA officers. The President-Elect of the Students' Association presented these documents on behalf of the outgoing President, Ms Lianne Bibby. In answer to a question, he explained that the provision in the Constitution that the Students' Association would not be affiliated to the National Union of Students was the result of a decision taken by the student body some years ago, but could be reversed by referendum if there was a move to do so.

- The Court decided:**
- (i) to approve the proposed amendments to the Constitution of the Students' Association;
 - (ii) to approve the reappointment to the DUSA Board of Management of Mr D Thomson, Mr W Sutherland, Mr M Fraser and Professor A Vardy, as well as the appointment of Mr M Sowden as a new member;
 - (iii) to note the report on the student welfare survey and to thank Ms Bibby for her work in co-ordinating it.

78. COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE SENATUS ACADEMICUS

The Court received a report from the meeting of the Senate on 31 May 2006 (**Appendix 4**).

- The Court decided:**
- (i) to approve the draft Academic Calendar for 2006/07;
 - (ii) to approve the recommendations concerning conferment of the title of Professor Emeritus;
 - (iii) to approve the proposed amendment of Ordinance 39 providing the definition of a graduate, subject to confirmation at a subsequent meeting;
 - (iv) otherwise, to note the report.

79. OTHER COMMITTEE REPORTS

The Court received reports from the following:

Campus Services Committee	16 May 2006	(Appendix 5)
Human Resources Committee	23 May 2006	(Appendix 6)
Audit Committee	24 May 2006	(Appendix 7)

- The Court decided:**
- (i) to approve the reports;
 - (ii) noting that the composition of appointing committees for non-clinical academic staff was governed by a procedure approved by the Court in 1992, to authorise the Director of Human Resources to interpret the procedure in accordance with the requirements of the new College structure – with approval by the Principal in individual cases where necessary –

until such time as a revised procedure was considered and approved by the Human Resources Committee.

80. UNIVERSITY SUPERANNUATION SCHEME – CHANGE OF TRUSTEE

The Court decided: on the recommendation of the Trustees of the University of Dundee Superannuation Scheme, to approve the appointment of Miss Margaret Aitken as a Trustee in succession to Mrs Jacqueline Robertson.

81. REVIEW OF TERMINATION OF STUDIES

The Court received a summary report on the findings of an ad hoc Committee comprising Mr Eric Sanderson (Convener), Ms Alison Newton and the Secretary, which had been established by the Court at its meeting on 20 February 2006 (with subsequent amendment of the Committee's membership being reported to the Court's meeting on 24 April 2006) for the purpose of undertaking on the Court's behalf, under the terms of Statute 9(5)(b), a review of a decision made by the Senate's Termination of Studies (Appeals) Committee. It was noted that the review had concluded that the decision of the Termination of Studies (Appeals) Committee should be upheld.

82. STAFF

Exercise of Delegated Powers: Professorial Appointments

The Court noted the appointment of the following:

Ms Kathryn Findlay, Ushida Findlay Architects	Personal Chair of Architecture & Environment	1 April 2006
Dr Philip Andrews-Speed	Personal Chair of Energy Policy	1 April 2006
Dr Aleksandar Jovanovic	Personal Chair of Experimental Medicine	1 April 2006

83. RETIRING MEMBERS

The Chairman expressed thanks to Ms Lianne Bibby, the outgoing President of the Students' Association, for her contribution to the work of the Court and wished her success in her future career.

The Chairman also paid tribute to Mr Bill Sutherland, who was attending his last meeting of the Court on completion of eight years in office as a co-opted member. During that time he had made a huge contribution to the governance of the University, serving most recently as Convener of the Audit

Committee and also attending, in that capacity, the Finance & Policy Committee. He had also participated in numerous working groups and review committees and had given particular service to the Students' Association – with whom he would be continuing as a Board member. The University and the Students' Association had benefited enormously from his wisdom and experience in finance, human resources and general management. Mr Sutherland replied that his association with the University had been both enjoyable and stimulating; he also complimented the Principal, other members of the senior management group and the lay members of Court for improving the quality and professionalism of the management and governance of the University.

APPENDIX 1

**AMENDMENTS TO UNIVERSITY ORDINANCES
(Minute 66)**

B. NEW ORDINANCES**Ordinance 56 – The Colleges**

- 1 From the date on which this Ordinance shall come into operation, there shall be a College of Medicine, Dentistry & Nursing, a College of Life Sciences, a College of Arts & Social Sciences and a College of Art & Design, Architecture and Engineering & Physical Sciences.
- 2 The Colleges shall comprise such Schools and subjects of study as shall be prescribed by the Senatus.
- 3 There shall be a Head of each College who shall be appointed by the Court, following consultation with the academic staff of the College, and who shall have such powers and duties as the Court may determine. The Head of College shall be a Vice-Principal of the University and shall, when present, preside over meetings of the College Board.
- 4 For each College there shall be constituted a College Board as follows:
 - (a) The Head of College;
 - (b) The Deans of the Schools comprising the College;
 - (c) The head of learning and teaching in the College;
 - (d) The head of research in the College;
 - (e) A number of elected members from the academic staff of the College equal to twice the number of the ex officio members in paragraphs (a) to (d) above;
 - (f) One or more members of academic staff from another College or Colleges, as determined by the Senatus on the recommendation of the College Board;
 - (g) One student from each of the Schools comprising the College, nominated annually by the students in those Schools, and the College representative on the Students' Association Council: provided that there shall be at least one postgraduate student representative and the College Board may authorise the nomination of one or more postgraduate students in the College for this purpose;
 - (h) Such other members of the teaching or research staff of the College as the Senatus, on the recommendation of the College Board, may from time to time determine;
 - (i) Other persons at the invitation of the Head of College and with the approval of the College Board.
- 5
 - (1) Elections for ordinary vacancies in the elected membership as defined in paragraph 4(e) above shall be held by means of a postal ballot during the second semester of the session in which the period of office of the retiring members expires: provided that in case of unavoidable delay such elections shall be held at the earliest practicable time, either in the summer vacation or in the first semester of the succeeding session.
 - (2) Casual vacancies shall be filled as soon as possible after they occur, either by co-option or by elections held in the same manner as elections for the filling of ordinary vacancies. A member co-opted or elected to fill a casual vacancy shall serve for the unexpired portion of the period of office of the member who is replaced.
 - (3) Nominations for election shall be made in writing to the College Secretary by any member of the electorate and shall be accompanied by the signed consent of the candidate.
 - (4) The period of office of elected members shall, save as provided in paragraph 5(2) above, be three years. A retiring member shall not be eligible for re-election until at least one year has elapsed from the end of the previous period of office.

- (5) A member co-opted or elected under paragraph 5(2) above who has served for a period not exceeding one year shall be eligible for election or re-election forthwith.
 - (6) The period of office shall run from the first day of August following the election: provided that in the case of a delayed election the period of office shall run from the date of the election and shall end on the thirty-first day of July three years thereafter.
- 6 Each College Board shall have the following powers and functions:
- (a) To advise the Senatus on all matters relating to the organisation of education and research in the subjects of the College, including the admission of students, curricula and examinations;
 - (b) To consider and report to the Senatus on any subject of study or combination of such subjects;
 - (c) To discuss any matters relating to the College and any matter referred to it by the Senatus, and to convey its views and recommendations thereon to the Senatus;
 - (d) Subject to the approval of the Senatus, to constitute such programme boards within the College as it may deem necessary, including joint programme boards with other Colleges;
 - (e) Such other powers and functions as the Court or Senatus may authorise and prescribe.

Ordinance 57 - Schools of Study

- 1 The Senatus shall prescribe which Schools shall belong to each of the Colleges.
- 2 There shall be a Dean of each School who shall be appointed by the Court, following consultation with the academic staff of the School, for a period of five years. Such initial term of office may be extended for further periods with the consent of the Principal and the School Board. Each Dean shall have such powers and duties and shall receive such remuneration as the Court may determine.
- 3 The Dean of each School shall, when present, preside over meetings of the School Board, except any meeting or part of a meeting at which the reappointment of the Dean for a further period is to be discussed, in which case the Board shall elect a chairperson for the purpose at that meeting.
- 4 For each School there shall be constituted a School Board as follows:
 - (a) The Dean;
 - (b) The conveners of such programme boards and the heads of such research divisions as have been established in the School;
 - (c) One or more members of academic staff from another School or Schools, as determined by the College Board on the recommendation of the School Board;
 - (d) One student from each of the Degree programmes (or, as determined by the Dean, appropriate group of Degree programmes) in the School, nominated annually by the students in the School: provided that the School Board may in addition authorise the nomination of one or more postgraduate students in the School;
 - (e) Either: all other members of the academic staff of the School,

or: members elected from the academic staff of the School, whose number, manner of election and period of office shall be determined by the College Board and endorsed by the Senatus;

- (f) Such other members of the teaching or research staff of the School as the College Board, on the recommendation of the School Board, may from time to time determine;
- (g) Other persons at the invitation of the Dean and with the approval of the School Board.

5 Each School Board shall have the following powers and functions:

- (a) To advise the Board of the College to which the School belongs on all matters relating to the organisation of education and research in the subjects of the School including curricula and examinations;
- (b) To be responsible for such operational aspects of student admissions, student administration, the management of learning and teaching, quality assurance and research as may be delegated to it by the College Board;
- (c) To be responsible for the effective deployment of such resources as are provided by the College or the University;
- (d) To discuss any matters related to the School and any matter referred to it by the College Board, and to convey its views and recommendations thereon to the College Board;
- (e) Such other powers and functions as the Senatus or the College Board may authorise and prescribe.

APPENDIX 2

PRINCIPAL'S REPORT (Minute 68)

Industrial Dispute

A full update will be provided to Court on the outcome of a meeting of the Joint Negotiating Committee for Higher Education Staff (JNCHES) due to take place on Tuesday June 6 at 4.30pm at the TUC Headquarters, Congress House. This follows further contacts between the parties facilitated by the TUC. At the time of writing, we are optimistic that the dispute will be resolved very soon and that all assessments and examinations for final year students will be marked and classified in good time for graduation. I will let Court know if the position changes.

Chancellor's Installation

Lord Patel of Dunkeld was formally installed as the University's fourth Chancellor at a ceremony in the Marryat Hall on 31 May. The honorary degree of Doctor of Laws was conferred on the Baroness Cox of Queensbury for her courageous humanitarian work throughout the world and on Professor Anna Glasier for her innovative work in the field of family planning and sex education. Two further honorary graduands, leading Scottish traditional singer Sheena Wellington and Dr Catherine Hamlin, founder of the Addis Ababa Fistula Foundation Hospital in Ethiopia, will receive their degrees at the graduation ceremonies in June and July.

Restructuring

Interviews for the Vice Principals/Heads of Colleges posts will take place on 14, 15 and 16 June. An excellent field of candidates has been attracted – both internal and external. An internal appointments process for Deans of Schools is now under way and we aim to complete this during July.

Finance

The high level resource allocation and budgeting process for 2006/07 is completed. There are many cost pressures – including pay, pensions and utility costs – which have influenced budget negotiations with Deans. Tough choices have been made about spending priorities, exacting income targets have been set and the timing of key schemes on the capital programme has been reviewed. Budgets are being set to accommodate the new school structure and to ensure as much stability as possible in this difficult transition year. Key staffing decisions will also aim to take account of the 2007/08 RAE.

The planning and financial framework documents included in the Court papers provide an opportunity to look carefully at the pressures facing the University over the next few years, to consider the action required to maintain the momentum of our education and research programmes and the steps required to ensure financial sustainability.

Learning and Teaching

The future delivery of nurse education in Fife is the subject of a separate report to Court.

The Dundee Degree Show – the annual showcase for final year students at Duncan of Jordanstone College of Art & Design attracted over 9,000 visitors on its opening night and was judged one of the best for some years in terms of the quality of students' work.

A University-led initiative aimed at making community-based further and higher education more accessible was launched in Glasgow. The Scottish Community Learning and Development Work-Based and Part-Time Training Consortium brings together four Scottish universities, 10 further education institutions and three community-based training providers. Chaired by Ian Ball, Vice-Dean of the Faculty of Education & Social Work, the Scottish consortium aims to establish a national strategy designed to open up further and higher education to wider participation.

The Enterprise Gym launched by the Centre for Enterprise Management marked the success of its first year with a high profile awards ceremony. The E-Gym, which aims to improve the self-reliance and employability of students by promoting an awareness of business enterprise and helping build entrepreneurial skills, attracted 130 students and local businesses including James Keiller Estates, Texol,

Insights, Ross & Bonnyman, LI Components and MDM Creative Services. The Royal Bank of Scotland has also shown strong support.

Dundee University Press has launched the first of an ambitious series of books in law, following the publication of its first titles in history earlier this year. The Law Essentials series will continue to roll out over the coming months, comprising concise study and revision guides for students of law in Scotland, covering topics from contract law and legal system essentials to revenue and family law.

Research and Enterprise

The University is leading in three outline bids in the Scottish Funding Council SRDG round. They are (in no particular order):

- (i) Post-genomic technologies led by Professor Roland Wolf, with the University of Edinburgh
- (ii) Scottish Centre for Advanced Nanotechnology (SCAN) led by Dr Gari Harris, with the Universities of Aberdeen and St Andrews
- (iii) Cognitive Neuroscience led by Dr Douglas Potter, with the University of St Andrews and Tayside University Hospitals NHS Trust

In addition we have submitted a feasibility study bid for a Social Exclusion Partnership led by Professor Jennifer Harris with a large number of potential collaborators and stakeholders. The University is also involved in nine additional bids led by other universities and we are associated with two further feasibility study bids by other institutions.

Awards and Honours

Professor Michael Ferguson, who holds the Chair of Molecular Parasitology and is Co-Director of the Post-Genomics and Molecular Interactions Centre in Life Sciences, has been awarded the prestigious C A Wright Memorial Medal from the British Society for Parasitology in recognition of his outstanding contribution to the discipline of parasitology.

Dr Linda Morris, Teaching Lecturer in Life Sciences has won a prestigious Higher Education Teaching Award from the Royal Society of Chemistry in recognition of outstanding teaching skills and the development of innovative approaches in the establishment of the new Pharmaceutical Chemistry degree programme and the complete restructuring of first year Chemistry.

Emeritus Professor Ronald Harden, now Director of Education at International Virtual Medical School, (IVIMEDS) based in Dundee, has been honoured with the Mentoring, Innovation and Leadership in Education Scholarship (MILES) award for 'outstanding contributions to the advancement of global medical education and academic medicine'. The award was presented at the 3rd Asia Pacific Medical Conference in Singapore.

BA Fine Art student Lynnmarie Szpak was among the prize-winning finalists in the 2006 Nationwide Mercury Prize Art Competition. The event is the UK's premier student art competition and exhibition.

The Accountancy & Business Finance Department has been ranked in the top five in Europe for research output. A paper in the journal *Accounting and Business Research* looked at the number of published articles in 19 different academic journals over a 10-year period to 2002 and compared the performance of 253 European universities. The University of Dundee department ranked fifth despite having fewer staff than any other top ten institution.

I look forward to welcoming Court members to Graduation and thank everyone for their contributions to the life and work of the University during 2005/06.

Alan Langlands
June 2006

APPENDIX 3

FINANCE & POLICY COMMITTEE (Minute 70(1))

A meeting of the Committee was held on 22 May 2006.

Present: Mr B W M Johnston (Convener), Principal, Professor D H Boxer, Professor A Burchell, Dr H Marriage, Mr J Milligan and Dr M R Ward.

In Attendance: Mr W Sutherland, Secretary, Director of Finance, Director of Information Services, Director of Strategic Planning, Miss L A Wilson, Mr G A Campbell and Ms S Beswick (for item 6).

1. MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

Resolved: to approve the minutes of the meeting held on 28 March 2006.

2. MATTERS ARISING

(1) Translational Medicine Research Institute (Minute 2)

The Director of Strategic Planning reported that negotiations had been finalised and that the anticipated public announcement of the collaboration agreement had been made on 3 April 2006.

The Committee reviewed the financing of the new-build on the Ninewells site. It was noted also that currency exposure continued to exercise Board members of TMRI Ltd. The Director of Strategic Planning stressed that the risk was carried by TMRI Ltd: from the University perspective, salaries and projects were both funded in sterling.

(2) University Borrowing (Minute 6)

The Director of Finance reported that Chris Smith of Noble Grossart had advised against fixing interest rates at present, as it was felt that longer term interest rates were unlikely to be reached given current trends in UK base rate decisions. After discussion, it was agreed that tenders should, however, be sought. The Convener, the Director of Finance, the Principal, Mr Sanderson, Mr Milligan, Ms Newton and Mr Sutherland had already been given delegated powers to consider tenders.

Resolved: to instruct Noble Grossart to issue tender documents for the fixing of interest rates.

(3) Riverside Biosciences (Minute 13)

Professor Boxer reported that a date for a hearing had been set, but that this had been postponed at the request of Riverside Biosciences. Legal advice was still that the University was in a good position.

3. FINANCIAL STRATEGY 2006/07 - 2010/11

The Director of Finance presented an updated financial strategy document for the period to 2010/11. The strategy showed a significant increase in the need to generate surpluses (£5m in 2006/07, rising to £13.5m in 2008/09 and beyond). The Convener commented on the University's difficulties in reaching target surpluses in previous years, but it was expected that there would be more accurate forecasting in future and a 'legal' budget would be submitted to the Court meeting on 12 June 2006. This 'legal' budget would be ready for discussion by 6 June 2006. In light of the likely considerable effect of the staff salary offer, consideration had been given as to how additional income could be raised. Given the significant increase required, the Committee would seek from the executive details of how the increases in surpluses would be achieved.

Growth beyond 2006/07 in SFC income had been assumed with an additional £1.4m expected in 2007/08 to support charity-funded research. For 2006/07, an additional £1m would be received through the SAAS and growth in overseas student numbers of 5% had been anticipated. Short courses fee income was also expected to increase by 3.5%.

In research, the University continued to be successful in attracting charity grants, but did not attract Research Council grants in proportion to the University's size. The impact of full economic costing would bring a larger overhead recovery on individual projects, but could mean a reduction in the number of grants awarded.

The staff cost budget for 2006/07 showed an 11.9% increase on the budget set for 2005/06, with the assumed pay award and costs of implementing the Framework Agreement amounting to 7%. This put more emphasis on examining productivity and reviewing research projects which were unprofitable.

- Resolved:**
- (i) to invite the Director of Finance to provide further details about activity under the 'Services Rendered' income heading;
 - (ii) to note that the Principal and Director of Finance were in the process of setting cash-limited budgets and income targets for each School to achieve the required surplus for 2006/07;
 - (iii) to ask the Principal and Director of Finance to prepare the financial strategy for Court, while the Committee would need to scrutinise proposals made to deliver the required cash generation.

4. MANAGEMENT ACCOUNTS FOR THE PERIOD TO 30 APRIL 2006

The Director of Finance reported that the forecast surplus for the financial year end was £2.2m. It was noted that depreciation costs had increased slightly.

Some slippage had been experienced on the capital programme and cash flow was being monitored carefully.

5. PENSIONS

The Trustees of the University's in-house pension scheme had received at their meeting on 27 March 2006 the draft actuarial report from the Scheme Actuary which showed that the deficit had risen from £3.1m in 2002 to £12.8m in 2005. There was lengthy discussion of the Convener's proposal, which he had discussed with the Director of Finance, on borrowing £5m to bridge part of the deficit and this was deemed to be cost-effective. It was agreed that the proposal should be examined further.

Discussion also took place on the possible payment by the University of employer's contributions to the USS Scheme beyond the current maximum of 40 years. USS had recommended that decisions on continuing payment of employer's contributions beyond 40 years should be made by individual institutions. The cost in 2006/07 of continuing to pay would be c £86k.

- Resolved:**
- (i) to recommend that the members of the University of Dundee Superannuation Scheme be invited to approve an increase in the employee contribution from 6.0% to 7.75%;
 - (ii) to recommend that employer's contributions to USS should not be paid beyond 40 years of service.

6. McCLELLAND REPORT ON PURCHASING

The Purchasing Manager, Ms S Beswick, reported that a Review of Public Procurement in Scotland had recently been carried out by John McClelland, now Chair of the Scottish Funding Council. The University was expected to participate fully in implementing the recommendations.

Some concern was expressed as to whether the new arrangements would be unnecessarily bureaucratic. Ms Beswick also pointed out that the Purchasing Office would require senior management support to implement some of the recommendations.

It was noted that the Purchasing Manager would be a member of the group set up to advise the SFC and the sector on implementation of the report's recommendations.

Resolved: to note the McClelland Report on Public Procurement in Scotland and to support the implementation of those parts of the report which would impact upon the University.

7. **NINEWELLS TEACHING AND LIBRARY ACCOMMODATION**

Professor Burchell outlined plans to provide new accommodation for learning and teaching at Ninewells Hospital and Medical School. There was a particular requirement for additional space for small-group teaching which had been highlighted by the General Medical Council Education Committee on its last visit to Dundee in 1999.

Resolved: to approve the Ninewells Teaching and Laboratory Accommodation project in principle, subject to detailed recommendations to Court in due course, including the timing of the proposed works and funding.

8. **VAT**

The Financial Controller, Miss L A Wilson, reported on three outstanding assessments with HM Revenue and Customs:

- (a) The University was going to a VAT tribunal about a £385k assessment in respect of the 2001/02 partial exemption assessment. The University's VAT advisers had found a number of errors in the work done by Customs and it was hoped that the figure of £385k would be reduced, irrespective of the outcome of the tribunal.
- (b) The University was continuing to dispute an assessment raised in respect of the non-business apportionment for 2003/04. A new proposal made by the University's VAT advisers had been rejected by Customs.
- (c) In respect of the zero-rating of the CIDR building, an assessment had been referred to the Local Reconsideration Officer. VAT of some £514k was at stake.

Should the tribunal about the 2001/02 partial exemption go against the University, there was no doubt that Customs would seek to review subsequent years. Discussions were taking place with the auditors as to the level of provision which would be appropriate.

9. **IDMOS SHARES**

The Director of Finance reported that it was being considered whether to sell a further third of the University's holding in IDMOS, but that a deal had not yet been brokered on the University's behalf.

10. **DEPUTY DIRECTOR OF FINANCE**

The Director of Finance reported that Ms Catriona Blake had been appointed Deputy Director of Finance from 1 August 2006.

APPENDIX 4

COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE SENATUS ACADEMICUS
(Minute 78)1. **PRINCIPAL'S REPORT**

The Principal reported on the latest situation with regard to the industrial dispute. The latest pay offer took the University beyond the limits of affordability but it would have to be met. There was little that could be done locally to affect the national negotiations beyond urging both sides to keep talking and reach a resolution in the interests of graduating students. There were good and constructive relationships locally between the University and DAUT. The University had committed to honour any settlement and it had not deducted pay from staff taking action short of a strike. He felt that it would be appropriate for the Senate to take a view on the industrial action given its responsibility for the academic work of the University and for the superintendence of the education of its students. On a motion to urge staff who were currently taking action to mark outstanding assessments for students due to graduate in June, the Senatus voted as follows: 35 for and 2 against, with 5 abstentions.

On the remainder of the paper, the Principal drew attention to the University's financial position and noted that the situation was worse than it had been for at least five years. Discussions with Deans and others were continuing and the possibilities of freezing vacant posts, delaying elements of the capital programme and re-phasing spending commitments were being considered.

2. **UNIVERSITY COURT**

The Senatus received a communication from the meeting of the University Court held on 24 April 2006.

The Senatus decided: for its part, to approve the report.

3. **DRAFT ACADEMIC CALENDAR 2006/2007**

The Senatus received the draft Academic Calendar for 2006/07 (annex).

The Senatus decided: to forward the draft Calendar to the Court for approval.

4. **PROFESSORES EMERITI**

The Senatus decided: subject to the concurrence of Court, to confer the title of Professor Emeritus upon the following:

Professor A Bissett-Johnson
Professor A F Newell

5. **AMENDMENT TO ORDINANCE 39: DEGREES, DIPLOMAS AND CERTIFICATES: DEFINITION OF A GRADUATE**

The Senatus decided: to recommend to Court the amendment of Ordinance 39 to include the following new section 6 (renumbering the existing section 6 as 7):

'A graduate of the University of Dundee is a person who has been awarded one or more of the degrees given in paragraph 1(1) above, or who has been awarded the Diploma of Higher Education or the Certificate of Higher Education; provided that as a condition of graduation and in accordance with paragraph (2) of Statute 20 they shall pay a registration fee. Such persons shall be members of the Graduates' Council.'

DRAFT ACADEMIC CALENDAR 2006/07

C - *body reporting to Court*
 S - *body reporting to Senate*

August 2006

18	Fri		Last day of resit examinations	
25	Fri		Last day for announcement of results	
			Last day for issue of Termination letters	
29	Tues	C	Finance and Policy Committee 2pm	

September 2006

4	Mon		Court Retreat	
			Last day for lodging appeals	
8	Fri		Last day for Faculty Committee Termination meetings	
11	Mon		First issue of Termination of Studies (Appeals) Committee agenda	Wk 0
			Beginning of Session	
12	Tues	C	University/Amicus MSF Joint Committee 2pm	
13	Wed	C	University/Unison Joint Committee 2pm	
15	Fri	S	Termination of Studies (Appeals) Committee 9.15am	
			Last day for Matriculation	
18	Mon		Semester 1 begins	Wk 1
19	Tues	C	Safety Sub-C 10am	
20	Wed	S	Postgraduate Affairs Committee 2pm	
21	Thur	S	Research Committee 12 noon	
22	Fri	C	University/DAUT Joint Committee 10am	
		S	Library & Information Services Committee 2pm	
25	Mon		College Board of Art & Design, Architecture and Engineering & Physical Sciences 4pm	Wk 2
26	Tues	S	Honorary Degrees Committee 10am	
		C	Audit Committee 2pm	
			College Board of Arts & Social Sciences 4pm	
27	Wed		College Board of Medicine, Dentistry & Nursing 4pm	
28	Thurs	S	Learning and Teaching Committee 10am	
			College Board of Life Sciences 4pm	

29 Fri C Campus Services Committee 10am

October 2006

2 Mon Dundee Autumn Holiday Wk 3

3 Tues C Human Resources Committee 2pm
University Opening Service 5.15pm

9 Mon C Finance and Policy Committee 2pm Wk 4

11 Wed Senate 4pm

12 Thurs S Recruitment, Admissions and Development Sub-C 2pm

16 Mon S Academic Quality Sub-Committee 10am Wk 5

17 Tues S Advisory Group on Appeals & Complaints Procedures 10am

23 Mon Court 2pm Wk 6

30 Mon Wk 7

November 2006

6 Mon Remuneration Committee 10am Wk 8
Academic Council Standing Committee 1pm

7 Tues C Risk Management Monitoring Group 10am

8 Wed S Postgraduate Affairs Committee 2pm

9 Thurs S Research Committee 12 noon

10 Fri S Library and Information Services Committee 2pm

13 Mon S Learning and Teaching Committee 10am Wk 9
College Board of Art & Design, Architecture and Engineering & Physical Sciences 4pm

14 Tues C Campus Services Committee 10am
College Board of Arts & Social Sciences 4pm

15 Wed College Board of Medicine, Dentistry & Nursing 4pm

16 Thurs Faculty Board of Life Sciences 4pm

20 Mon C Finance and Policy Committee 2pm Wk 10

27 Mon Academic Council 1pm Wk 11

28 Tues C Audit Committee 2pm

29 Wed Senate 4pm

December 2006

4 Mon Semester 1 examinations begin Wk 12

5	Tues	C	University/Amicus MSF Joint Committee 2pm	
10	Sun		University Carol Service 5pm	
11	Mon			Wk 13
15	Fri		Semester 1 examinations end End of Semester 1	
18	Mon		Court 2pm	
22	Fri		University closed after business until start of business on Wednesday 3 January 2007	
25	Mon		Christmas Day	
<u>January 2007</u>				
3	Wed		Start of business	
8	Mon		Freshers' Week – January Intake	
11	Thurs	C	University/Unison Joint Committee 2pm	
15	Mon		Start of Semester 2	Wk 14
		C	University/DAUT Joint Committee 10am	
17	Wed	C	Safety Sub-C 10am	
18	Thurs	S	Research Committee 12 noon	
22	Mon		College Board of Art & Design, Architecture and Engineering & Physical Sciences 4pm	Wk 15
23	Tues		College Board of Arts & Social Sciences 4pm	
24	Wed		College Board of Medicine, Dentistry & Nursing 4pm	
25	Thurs		College Board of Life Sciences 4pm	
29	Mon	C	Finance and Policy Committee 2pm	Wk 16
30	Tues	C	Human Resources Committee 2pm	
<u>February 2007</u>				
5	Mon			Wk 17
7	Wed		Senate 4pm	
12	Mon			Wk 18
19	Mon		Court 2pm	Wk 19
23	Fri	S	Library & Information Services Committee 2pm	
26	Mon			Wk 20
27	Tues	C	Campus Services Committee 2pm	

March 2007

5	Mon			Wk 21
6	Tues	C	Audit Committee 2pm	
7	Wed	S	Postgraduate Affairs Committee 2pm	
8	Thurs	S	Research Committee 12 noon	
12	Mon	S	Learning and Teaching Committee 10am	Wk 22
			College Board of Art & Design, Architecture and Engineering & Physical Sciences 4pm	
13	Tues		College Board of Arts & Social Sciences 4pm	
14	Wed		College Board of Medicine, Dentistry & Nursing 4pm	
15	Thurs		College Board of Life Sciences 4pm	
19	Mon			Wk 23
20	Tues		Academic Council Standing Committee 1pm	
26	Mon	C	Finance and Policy Committee 2pm	Wk 24
28	Wed		Senate 4pm	
29	Thurs	S	Recruitment, Admissions and Development Sub-C 2pm	

April 2007

2	Mon		Easter vacation	
			Dundee Holiday	
6	Fri		Good Friday	
8	Sun		Easter Sunday	
23	Mon		Court 2pm	Wk 25
			Examinations begin	
25	Wed	C	University/Amicus MSF Joint Committee 2pm	
30	Mon	C	Safety Sub-C 10am	Wk 26
			Academic Council 1pm	

May 2007

1	Tue	S	Academic Quality Sub-Committee 10am	
4	Fri	C	University/DAUT Joint Committee 10am	
7	Mon		Dundee Holiday	Wk 27
8	Tues	S	Advisory Group on Appeals & Complaints Procedures 10am	
		C	University/Unison Joint Committee 2pm	

9	Wed	C	Risk Management Monitoring Group 10am	
		S	Postgraduate Affairs Committee 2pm	
10	Thurs	S	Research Committee 12 noon	
11	Fri	S	Library & Information Services Committee 2pm	
14	Mon	S	Learning and Teaching Committee 10am	Wk 28
			College Board of Art & Design, Architecture and Engineering & Physical Sciences 4pm	
15	Tues	C	Campus Services Committee 10am	
			College Board of Arts & Social Sciences 4pm	
16	Wed		College Board of Medicine, Dentistry & Nursing 4pm	
17	Thurs		College Board of Life Sciences 4pm	
21	Mon	C	Finance and Policy Committee 2pm	Wk 29
22	Tues	C	Human Resources Committee 10am	
		C	Audit Committee 2pm	
25	Fri		Semester 2 examinations end	
			End of Semester 2	
28	Mon		Dundee Holiday	
30	Wed		Senate 4pm	
<u>June 2007</u>				
11	Mon		Court 3pm	
20	Wed		Graduation Ceremonies	
21	Thurs		Graduation Ceremonies	
22	Fri		Graduation Ceremonies	
<u>July 2007</u>				
10	Tues		Medicine & Dentistry Graduation (provisional)	
<u>August 2007</u>				
6	Mon		Resit examinations begin	
28	Tues	C	Finance and Policy Committee 2pm	
<u>September 2007</u>				
3	Mon		Court Retreat	
10	Mon		Semester 1 begins	Wk 0

APPENDIX 5

CAMPUS SERVICES COMMITTEE (Minute 79)

A meeting of the Committee was held on 16 May 2006.

Present: Dr L A L Rolland (Convener), Dr R Abboud, Dr J Elliott, Professor A Newell, Professor S Unwin, Ms C Bain, Dr B Gillies and President of the Students' Association.

In Attendance: Dr D Duncan, Mr D Yule, Mr D White, Mr G Davies, Mr P Evans, Mr G Hickman, Mr G Valentine and Mr M Galloway.

1. MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

Resolved: to approve the minutes of the meeting held on 28 February 2006.

2. MATTERS ARISING

(1) Masterplan (Minute 2(2))

The Director of Campus Services advised the Committee that the planned exhibition of the Masterplan would take place in June in the Tower Foyer; that Professor Unwin would be talking later about the next steps in the development of the Masterplan; and that he was in discussion with Farrells regarding the development of the multi-purpose building on the eastern edge of the Campus Green. Mr Galloway advised the Committee that the Planning Department had approved the amended Masterplan and that it now had formal status in the consideration of future planning applications.

(2) Space Management Group (Minute 5)

The Committee was advised of a slight revision to the remit of the Space Management Group in respect of arrangements at Ninewells.

(3) Green Travel (Minute 7)

It was noted that Estates & Buildings staff would be meeting with the Dean of Education & Social Work on 26 May 2006 to prepare a presentation to the Faculty on Green Travel.

3. DISABILITY DISCRIMINATION ACT

Mr Valentine gave a presentation on the legislative requirements of the Disability Discrimination Act and how the DDA Group, which includes representatives across the University with knowledge, experience or responsibilities in disability compliance, was meeting the needs of the Act across the campus. The Committee was shown working examples of various physical alterations incorporated in a selection of buildings across the University. The Committee accepted that a practical methodology was required in the application of DDA measures and supported the design quality of the various external ramps around the campus.

Resolved: to consider the need for and remit of a DDA Working Group that would act as a sub-group of the Campus Services Committee and assist in determining DDA policy.

4. CAPITAL PROGRAMME AND REPORTS ON PROJECTS OVER £2m

The Convener invited Committee members to raise any questions on the capital programme. The Director of Campus Services responded to a question on delays to existing programmes and identified the measures that were typically taken to mitigate delays.

Mr Galloway advised the Committee of the need for further discussions with the Planning Department on the Riverside development before submission of a formal planning application. The Convener confirmed that the Design Review Group still had to sign off on this particular project and the Secretary advised that the programme might be subject to rescheduling.

The Director of Campus Services advised the Committee of his intention to bring a paper to a future Committee identifying the procedure used in formulating the capital programme and the prioritisation of projects and actions taken to balance the programme against income. The restructuring of the University also highlighted a need to bring greater clarity to the respective Colleges on their individual allocations.

5. **LONG-TERM MAINTENANCE**

The Head of Estates presented a paper on long-term maintenance and advised of the need for a strategic approach to planning and a move towards more robust statistical and survey information that would help prioritise spending and assist in responding to any new funding streams.

6. **NINEWELLS CAMPUS**

Mr Hickman gave a presentation to the Committee on estates issues at Ninewells. He provided an overview of the various projects on site and in the pipeline; an overview of the demands upon space and infrastructure at Ninewells; an insight into how the Estates Office at Ninewells is resourced and how it provides its embedded service to the Faculty; and an update on progress on the Ninewells Development Plan.

7. **PUBLIC ART POLICY**

The Policy and Planning Manager reported the need for the University to develop a public art plan to comply with the requirements of Dundee City Council Planning and Transportation Department. The plan should ring-fence funding for public art and identify the process of selection and location of art inside and outside buildings on the City campus. The plan would be developed by Campus Services in collaboration with the Design Review Group. The Director of Planning and Transportation advised that he was particularly keen to have art intrinsic to buildings, rather than works of art which could be removed from buildings after installation.

There followed some discussion amongst Committee members about the virtues of incorporating art on campus. It was recognised that art could assist in attracting students and help to improve the aesthetics of the campus. The financial burden of the art plan at an estimated 1% of the value of building works, however, would require consideration alongside other demands upon the capital programme.

Resolved:

- (i) to note the need for a public art plan and the financial implications;
- (ii) to encourage the use of art from Duncan of Jordanstone College wherever possible.

8. **TRAFFIC MANAGEMENT**

The Policy and Planning Manager advised the Committee of the remit and operational parameters of the Traffic Management Group, a body set up to manage traffic on the City campus. He then updated the Committee on a number of topical issues, as follows :

- (a) Staff and students were receiving announcements of key changes to vehicular and pedestrian traffic routes through Groupwise.
- (b) Estates & Buildings was experiencing difficulties with a small percentage of staff, students, public and contractors ignoring traffic measures put in place for their safety: this could place the capital programme at risk in the event of any accidents occurring on campus.
- (c) The newly appointed traffic controllers were proving their worth in helping to manage compliance with traffic measures.

- (d) Funding had been earmarked within the capital programme to progress a traffic impact study that would look into the future vehicular and pedestrian routes on campus and develop the principles of greater pedestrian priority routes identified within the Campus Masterplan. The brief was under development and a shortlist of external consultants had been established.

Resolved: (i) to note the remit of the Traffic Management Group and acknowledge its efforts to date in managing the escalating construction activity on site;

(ii) to note and support the development of a traffic impact study.

9. **DESIGN REVIEW GROUP**

Professor Unwin gave a presentation to Committee members on 'The Masterplan - The Next Steps', identifying the various areas that needed to be considered as part of a continuing process of developing the campus. The Convener advised the Committee that these areas would form a central focus for the Design Review Group.

Committee members expressed reassurance that the development of the Campus Masterplan was in safe hands.

10. **AUDIT SCOTLAND**

The Secretary reported that Audit Scotland was carrying out an audit of estates management across Scottish Universities, on behalf of the Scottish Executive. This University had agreed to take part in the audit and it was hoped that some benefit would arise from its outcome.

11. **RESIDENCES**

A member questioned the pricing structure of the new student residences and raised a concern regarding their competitiveness against alternative provision by local developers and against pricing structures of other Scottish Universities. The Secretary advised that the pricing structure was under constant review and that there was a need to compare 'all in' prices, as in some instances local developers were not factoring the cost of utilities into marketed rates.

12. **HUNTER STREET DEVELOPMENT**

The Director of Planning and Transportation advised the Committee that the Council was progressing with the development of the Hunter Street car park with an intended mix of multi-storey car parking on upper floor levels and retail use on the ground level. Completion was expected within 18 months. The University would be consulted as adjacent property owners.

APPENDIX 6

HUMAN RESOURCES COMMITTEE
(Minute 79)

A meeting of the Committee was held on 23 May 2006.

Present: Ms E A Robertson (Convener), Dr R J Abboud, Professor J Calderhead, Professor C P Downes and Dr J Lowe.

In Attendance: Dr D J Duncan, Mrs P A Milne and Mrs J M Strachan.

1. MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

Resolved: to approve the minutes of the meeting held on 31 January.

2. MATTERS ARISING

(1) Extract from Court Minutes

An extract from the minutes of the meeting of the University Court on 20 February 2006 was noted. Specific reference had been made to the AUT ballot on the national pay negotiations and also to recent suggestions received from the Health and Safety Executive. Both of these items were discussed in the substantive part of the meeting.

(2) Professoriate Statistics (Minute 2(2))

Statistics relating to gender and ethnicity of the professoriate were discussed. It was noted that there were 127 male professors and 26 female professors currently in post, in both personal and established Chairs. Out of these, 15 male professors and 10 female professors had been appointed since 1 July 2004. It was noted that the University had been undertaking certain initiatives such as working with existing female professors to identify barriers facing females when applying for senior positions. It was acknowledged that the position of the University must always be to attract and appoint the best candidates, but the Committee felt that it was important to ensure that no bias was introduced at any stage of the process.

Resolved: to provide statistics to the Committee on an annual basis relating to the appointment of staff at professorial level, as well as comparisons with national statistics.

(3) Staff Benefit Schemes (Minute 2(5))

It was reported that 217 staff had taken advantage of the Home Computer Initiative (HCI) scheme at the beginning of April, before HCI schemes were closed under the Budget changes. It was noted that only 33 staff had signed up for Childcare Vouchers and it was suggested that this scheme could be publicised more extensively, to new and existing staff, highlighting the tax savings and clarifying the method of application. It was noted that the Bikes at Work Scheme still had to be launched.

Resolved: (i) to publicise the Childcare Vouchers Scheme more extensively, using Hermes and other media.

(ii) to raise the maximum salary sacrifice for childcare vouchers from £50 to £55, in line with budget increases.

(4) Integration of School of Nursing & Midwifery (Minute 4)

The Secretary confirmed that the integration of 40-50 staff from the School's support services into central student and academic support services had commenced. It was confirmed that this was an on-going process and for many it would not result in a change in location but only a different line management structure.

3. UNIVERSITY RESTRUCTURING

The Director of Human Resources updated the Committee on the appointment of the Heads of College positions. The recruitment consultants, Perrett Laver, had been handling the recruitment process and it was reported that the response had been extremely positive for each of the four positions. Shortlisting meetings would take place on 1 and 2 June, and formal interviews would be held on 14, 15 and 16 June. It was confirmed that the process in relation to the appointment of Deans would be commencing shortly.

Work was also in progress in relation to the deployment of support staff in Colleges and Schools and the identification of suitable space for the location of College and School offices. It was highlighted that one of the key issues in relation to the devolution of Human Resources staff to the Colleges was that there were economies of scale attached to the central function and it was anticipated that some of this would be lost when devolving certain activities out to the Colleges. The Director of Human Resources confirmed that she was planning to discuss with the Deans what additional resources could be provided by the Faculties under the new College structure.

4. SCHOOL OF NURSING & MIDWIFERY – FIFE CAMPUS

The Secretary confirmed that consultation was continuing with the various stakeholders involved in the provision of services on the Fife Campus and, although certain restrictions were being stipulated by each of these stakeholders, he was satisfied that progress was being made.

5. PENSIONS

It was highlighted that recent changes to pensions legislation had provided an opportunity for employers to continue paying contributions for staff beyond 40 years of service. It was noted that this had been discussed by the Finance & Policy Committee and that removal of the current ceiling on employer's contributions had not been approved. The Human Resources Committee discussed this further and felt that a change in the position would also introduce equity issues, as it would only impact on a very small number of staff.

Resolved: to support the Finance & Policy Committee's decision that no change should be made to the current maximum for employer's contributions.

6. HUMAN RESOURCES

(1) Pay Award 2006/07

The statement produced by the Principal, and circulated to staff and the media on the current industrial dispute, was highlighted and the encouragement in this statement for all staff to complete assessments and mark examination scripts was noted. It was confirmed that all examinations at Dundee had been set, but in certain areas some marking was not taking place. It was estimated that 10 – 15% of the final cohort of students would be affected by this action. It was confirmed that a great deal of work was being done to try to minimise the impact of the action.

The Director of Human Resources reported that discussions, facilitated by ACAS, had taken place on 23 May and that the view from the employers' side was that the maximum offer was on the table. Concerns were expressed about the University's financial position and the impact on Colleges and support services' budgets for next year if a more generous deal was negotiated at a national level.

In relation to the 'action short of a strike', the view was expressed that the University should have a policy in place that if staff decided to take this course of action, there would be consequences. It was considered that this would be a fair position to adopt, taking into account the impact on other staff and on students.

Resolved: to request officers to assess the impact that the 'action short of a strike' had had on students and the University as a whole and to report to the next meeting.

(2) Framework Agreement

It was reported that AUT, Unison and Amicus had submitted the locally negotiated agreement detailing the new pay and grading structure to their respective national offices. At this level, AUT had approved the agreement and Amicus had responded with minor comments, but Unison had raised more significant issues which required further consideration by the local office and possible consultation with the other unions. One of their main issues of concern was the introduction of a minimum starting salary for lecturers and the equality issues that this raised. DAUT had confirmed that, although the original intention was for the three unions to go to ballot together, if significant delays were envisaged they might reconsider their position.

As it had been agreed that HERA job evaluation would not commence until the pay and grading structure had been agreed, it was noted that the main exercise would not get under way until the unions went to ballot. It had been agreed, however, that the pilot should be extended to Life Sciences and to Information & Communication Services.

(3) Policy Development(a) Alcohol, Drugs and Substance Misuse Policy & Procedure

Resolved: to approve the policy, subject to a minor amendment requested by Amicus.

(b) Disciplinary and Grievance Procedure for Clerical, Technical and Manual Staff

It was highlighted that the existing policy had been amended to ensure compliance with the Dispute Resolution regulations. It was noted that a more extensive review of the policy was planned, along with the development of associated procedural guidelines. In relation to the draft revised policy, certain changes were requested by the Committee, specifically: (a) amendment of terminology referring to the head of department's 'depute' to 'deputy or nominee', as stated in other University policies, (b) clarification that the person making decisions relating to disciplinary action would not be involved in the investigation, (c) clear definition in the policy of who had the authority to suspend, and (d) expansion of the Appeals sections to include confirmation that the grounds for any appeal should be stated.

Regarding procedures relating to academic staff, it was noted that work was still taking place at a national level in connection with the development of a new model statute. For academic-related staff, it was confirmed that the statutory Disciplinary and Grievance Procedure would apply.

Resolved: to approve the revised Disciplinary and Grievance Procedure, subject to the amendments requested by the Committee.

7. **EQUALITY AND DIVERSITY**(1) Equality and Diversity Report

A report from the Equality and Diversity Officer was received.

(2) Equality and Diversity Code of Practice

It was noted that a Code of Practice had been developed to address the issues of equality and diversity in the preparation of RAE 2008 submissions, and that this would sit within the overarching policy. Feedback had been obtained on the Code of Practice at training sessions conducted recently for staff involved in the decision-making processes relating to the RAE.

Resolved: to approve the Code of Practice.

(3) Employment Equality (Age) Regulations 2006

It was highlighted that with the introduction of new anti-discrimination legislation relating to age on 1 October 2006, there were certain actions required by the University to ensure compliance. A procedure for retirements was considered.

Resolved: to approve the procedure relating to retirements and to request that amendments to other policies and practices be submitted to the Committee for consideration in due course.

8. **PERSONAL AND PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT**

Reports from the Director of Management and Professional Development, the Director of Academic Professional Development and the Generic Skills Training Co-ordinator were received.

There was some discussion relating to the training to be provided to support the restructuring programme, including management training, implementing strategy and organisational development. It was also highlighted that a major responsibility for the Heads of Colleges in the new structure would be to ensure that the Staff Development and Review scheme was implemented for all staff and records relating to this maintained at College level.

It was noted that the University had been successful in securing a place on the 'Change Academy' initiative for a project focusing on 'Enhancing the Student Experience as a Research-led University Restructures' and that a Change Academy project team had been proposed.

It was confirmed that the appointment of a Generic Skills Training Co-ordinator had been established at the University as a result of money made available following the Roberts Review. It was confirmed that Dr Christine Milburn had been appointed to this position and had made good progress in developing 'Generic Skills Dundee' and formulating a strategic plan for the resource.

9. **HEALTH AND SAFETY**

(1) Safety Sub-Committee

The minutes of the meeting of the Safety Sub-Committee, held on 26 April 2006, were received.

(2) Health and Safety Report

A report from the Head of Safety Services was received. It was agreed that clarity on certain points would be requested from the Head of Safety Services.

Reference was made to the letter received from the Health and Safety Executive and it was confirmed that discussions had taken place between the Secretary, the Director of Human Resources and the Head of Safety Services to progress the issues raised by the HSE.

Resolved: to submit the report from the Head of Safety Services to Court¹.

10. **LOCAL JOINT COMMITTEES**

(1) University/Amicus-MSF Joint Committee

The minutes of the meeting held on 26 April 2006 were received.

¹ Not included here

(2) University/UNISON Joint Committee

The minutes of the meeting held on 9 May 2006 were received.

(3) University/DAUT Joint Committee

The draft minutes of the meeting held on 5 May 2006 were received.

11. **ANNUAL REVIEW**

Reports from the Faculty Annual Review Groups (annex A), the Administrative, Library & Computing (ALC) Annual Review Group (annex B) and the Technical Staff Annual Review Group (annex C) were received.

The criteria for promotion to Senior Lecturer was discussed. It was noted that the Faculty of Life Sciences had specific promotion criteria for research-specific posts, for teaching posts and for those involved in both teaching and research. It was felt that this approach could usefully be considered by other Faculties.

ANNUAL REVIEW 2006 – RESULTS OF FACULTY ANNUAL REVIEW GROUP MEETINGS

This section of the minute has been redacted to protect personal data. The University claims the exemption in S.38(1)(b) of the Freedom of Information (Scotland) Act 2002.

ALC ANNUAL REVIEW GROUP

A meeting of the ALC Annual Review Group was held on 21 March 2006.

Present: Dr D J Duncan (Convener), Mrs P A Milne, Mr G Westwater, Ms E Douglas, Mrs J M Strachan and Professor C Whatley.

In Attendance: Mr M Skeldon

This section of the minute has been redacted to protect personal data. The University claims the exemption in S.38(1)(b) of the Freedom of Information (Scotland) Act 2002.

TECHNICAL STAFF ANNUAL REVIEW 2006

The Annual Review Panel meeting was held on 11 May 2006.

Present: Dr K M Peebles (Convener), Mr I R Leith and Mrs G R Jones.

In Attendance: Ms L Poor

This section of the minute has been redacted to protect personal data. The University claims the exemption in S.38(1)(b) of the Freedom of Information (Scotland) Act 2002.

APPENDIX 7

AUDIT COMMITTEE (Minute 79)

A meeting of the Committee was held on 24 May 2006.

Present: Mr W Sutherland (Convener), Mrs S Brown, Dr J Lowe and Ms J M Thomson.

In Attendance: Mr B W M Johnston, Deputy Secretary, Director of Finance and Ms L A Wilson; Mr A Aitchison (Ernst & Young) and Mr D MacLaren (PricewaterhouseCoopers).

1. MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

Resolved: to approve the minutes of the meeting on 7 March 2006.

2. MATTERS ARISING

(1) Student Debt Analysis (Minute 2(2))

A further summary had been sent to members individually, as agreed at the previous meeting. It was confirmed that, when payment of fees by arrangement was taken into account, the current debt provision exceeded hard core debt; efforts would still be made, however, to recover as much of this as possible.

(2) Management Arrangements in Finance Office (Minute 2(3))

It was noted that Ms Catriona Blake, Head of Finance at the University of Abertay, had been appointed Deputy Director of Finance from 1 August 2006.

(3) Internal Audit Needs Assessment and Strategic Plan (Minute 3)

It was confirmed that the document had been finalised in discussion between officers and the auditors, in the light of comments by the Committee.

(4) Joint Initiatives (Minute 6)

The Director of Finance reported that he had met with his counterparts in the University of Abertay and the University of St Andrews in January. It had been agreed to extend collaboration in purchasing and for this purpose to expand the group to include Dundee College. Benchmarking of Finance Offices had also been discussed and information on banking and insurance had been shared. Other work priorities had so far prevented further collaborative activity, but it was acknowledged that there would continue to be pressure in the public and related sectors to pursue such collaboration; a report on further progress would be made to the Committee next session. There was some discussion of joint procurement and the McClelland Report – on which, it was noted, SFC would be providing guidance.

3. INTERNAL AUDIT REPORTS

The Committee received copies of the following reports:

(1) Student Retention

This was the final report (2005/16) from Henderson Loggie. While noting that student retention was an outcome of the academic process and not therefore a natural topic for internal audit, it was agreed that it was a key institutional performance indicator and merited attention from the Committee. The report itself, however, did not provide any numerical analysis.

Resolved: to invite officers to provide the Committee with statistics on student retention, broken down by subject area.

(2) Follow-up Review of Recommendations from 2004/05 Internal Audit Programme

This review, carried out by PricewaterhouseCoopers, showed that of 47 higher grade (A/B) and selected other recommendations made in Henderson Loggie reports, 16 had been fully implemented, 23 had been partly implemented and 8 had not been implemented. This information had been collated in March, however, and it was noted that the status of some recommendations was subject to updating. The auditors stressed that the pattern of implementation revealed was not, in their experience, unusual.

The Committee discussed several outstanding recommendations, in particular the regular reconciliation of the GVA system to CODA, which it was agreed should be limited to the top 10-15 major capital projects as originally suggested. The Committee endorsed the view that it was important to engage with departments about the value of internal audit and to secure their commitment to the implementation of recommended actions.

- Resolved:**
- (i) to invite the internal auditors:
 - (a) to extend this transitional follow-up review to include outstanding recommendations made prior to 2004/05;
 - (b) to maintain the practice of reporting on the implementation of internal audit recommendations to each meeting of the Audit Committee;
 - (c) in follow-up work and in their own reports, to have regard to material value when assessing the level of priority appropriate to individual recommendations;
 - (d) to identify specific target dates for the implementation of all outstanding recommendations in their future follow-up reports;
 - (ii) to draw to the attention of senior management and Court the Committee's view that the University's staff development and review scheme would never be particularly effective while it remained voluntary.

(3) Internal Audit Programme 2005/06 – Progress Report

The Committee noted the current status of internal audit work. Attention was drawn to an imminent study on risk management, which would take stock of the practices and procedures adopted thus far, including reporting mechanisms; this was an opportune time to conduct such a review, with the benefit of a fresh perspective from the new internal auditors and in advance of the restructuring of the University into Colleges.

4. **EXTERNAL AUDIT PLANNING – YEAR ENDING 31 JULY 2006**

The Committee received the external auditors' client service memorandum outlining their approach to the forthcoming audit. Areas which were noted as having a potentially significant impact on the University's accounts included the requirement fully to adopt FRS 17 for stating the value of the University's pension schemes and variances in building costs for the residences; also the disputed VAT assessment for the year ended 31 July 2002 (now at tribunal stage), which if not resolved in the University's favour could be compounded by further claims for subsequent years.

It was noted that the fee proposed for the audit of Dundee University Press Ltd was a matter for the Board of the company.

Resolved: to approve the proposed audit approach.

5. **AUDIT COMMITTEE SELF-ASSESSMENT**

The Committee received a report from the Deputy Secretary on the self-assessment exercise involving the completion by individual members and officers of the questionnaire devised by Ernst & Young. It was noted that the lowest aggregate scores occurred in the section of the questionnaire on understanding roles and responsibilities. Members seemed generally more satisfied with the Committee's performance in the other sections, relating to process. The Committee discussed various issues arising from the report.

Resolved: to adopt the following changes in procedure as a result of the self-assessment exercise:

- (a) to review the Committee's terms of reference on an annual basis;
- (b) to introduce a standing item on the agenda for future Committee meetings, providing an opportunity for the Secretary to report on any significant matters relating to legal or regulatory compliance within the University;
- (c) to adopt the practice followed by the Court, whereby the Convener would in future meet annually with individual members of the Committee on an informal basis to discuss their contribution and obtain feedback;
- (d) to provide a structured induction for new members of the Audit Committee, aimed particularly at those who were not Court members.

6. **ANNUAL REPORT ON GOOD SCIENTIFIC PRACTICE**

The Committee received a copy of a completed return by the University for the calendar year 2005 in response to a request from Research Councils UK, concerning institutional policy with regard to good scientific practice and any instances of scientific misconduct that might have occurred. The Committee also received the University's Code of Policy and Procedures for Investigating and Resolving Allegations of Misconduct in Research, as it was a requirement of the RCUK enquiry that such procedures should be brought to the attention of the Audit Committee. The explicit responsibility laid upon heads of departments in the Code was welcomed by the Committee.

It was noted that, while scientific misconduct was included in the institutional risk register under the general heading of 'fraud, impropriety or misconduct', there was a need to review the identified controls to cover the specific area of research fraud. It was confirmed that this would be taken forward with other issues arising from the forthcoming internal audit review of risk management.

7. **CONVENER**

This being Mr Sutherland's last meeting, Mr Johnston paid tribute to his leadership of the Committee during a period of substantial change and development in the University. Under his convenership, which had been characterised by a robust approach tempered with a sense of humour, the Committee had not only kept abreast of institutional developments but had in some instances been able to anticipate issues before they arose. For his part, Mr Sutherland thanked members for their contribution and Mr Evans for his support as Committee Secretary. It was very rewarding to have been involved in the changes taking place and he urged the Committee to remain alert in the University's interest during the major challenges that lay ahead.